

## J. GREGORY CORNETT

DIRECT DIAL 502-560-4210 DIRECT FAX 502-627-8710

gcornett@ogdenlaw.com

1700 PNC PLAZA
500 WEST JEFFERSON STREET
LOUISVILLE, KENTUCKY 40202-2874
(502) 582-1601
FAX (502) 581-9564
www.ogdenlaw.com

March 28, 2005

Elizabeth O'Donnell
Executive Director
Kentucky Public Service Commission
211 Sower Boulevard
Frankfort, Kentucky 40601

MAR 2 9 2005

PUBLIC SETVICE
COMMISSION

RE: In the Matter of: Joint Application of Louisville Gas and Electric Company and Kentucky Utilities Company for a Certificate of Public Convenience and Necessity, and a Site Compatibility Certificate, for the Expansion of the Trimble County Generating Station

Case No. 2004-00507

Dear Ms. O'Donnell:

Enclosed please find and accept for filing the original and ten copies of Louisville Gas and Electric Company's and Kentucky Utilities Company's Response to IBEW, Local 2100, and Greater Louisville Building and Construction Trades Council's Motion to Release Documents Under Seal in the above-referenced matter. Please confirm your receipt of this filing by placing the stamp of your Office with the date received on the enclosed additional copies and return them to me in the enclosed self-addressed stamped envelope.

Should you have any questions or need any additional information, please contact me at your convenience.

Very truly yours,

J. Gregory Cornett

JGC/ec Enclosures

cc: Parties of Record

## COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

## BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION FOR WED

In the Matter of:	MAR 2 9 2005
JOINT APPLICATION OF LOUISVILLE GAS	) PUBLIC SERVICE
AND ELECTRIC COMPANY AND KENTUCKY	) COMMISSION
UTILITIES COMPANY FOR A CERTIFICATE	)
OF PUBLIC CONVENIENCE AND NECESSITY,	)
AND A SITE COMPATIBILITY CERTIFICATE,	) CASE NO: 2004-00507
FOR THE EXPANSION OF THE TRIMBLE	)
COUNTY GENERATING STATION	

RESPONSE OF LOUISVILLE GAS AND ELECTRIC COMPANY AND KENTUCKY UTILITIES COMPANY TO MOTION OF INTERNATIONAL BROTHERHOOD OF ELECTRICAL WORKERS, LOCAL 2100 AND GREATER BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION AND TRADES COUNCIL TO RELEASE DOCUMENTS UNDER SEAL

Louisville Gas and Electric Company and Kentucky Utilities Company (collectively, "the Companies") hereby respond to International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers, Local 2100's and the Greater Building and Construction Trades Council's (collectively, "Movants") March 17, 2005 Motion to Release Documents Under Seal. As set forth below, the documents that were afforded confidential treatment in Case No. 2000-00112¹ continue to qualify for confidential treatment, and, therefore, Movants' March 17, 2005 Motion should be denied. Additionally, the documents that Movants seek to unseal have no relevance to the issues before the Commission in this case and, therefore, regardless of whether they continue to qualify for confidential treatment, the Motion should be denied.

The documents at issue are documents that were responsive to a Commission data request that sought a Request for Proposal ("RFP") for the construction of the Selective Catalytic Reduction units at issue in Case No. 2000-00112. In responding to that request, the Companies

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Application of Kentucky Utilities Company and LG&E for Certificate of Public Convenience and Necessity to Construct Selective Catalytic Reduction Control (SCR) Technologies.

informed the Commission that the proposals submitted in response to the Companies' RFP were subject to Non-Disclosure Agreements which provided the bidders with certain rights regarding public disclosure, because the information provided by the bidders is proprietary. Moreover, just because the RFP process was completed and a bidder was chosen does not mean that the protected documents should be made public. Contractors and other parties frequently use historical data to extrapolate bidding strategies and future prices, and that could be done with the information at issue here. Thus, disclosure of this information, even if after the fact, will still reveal how the bidders formulated their bids, how pricing was quoted, and the like. In other words, they will reveal significant information about the processes used which would provide unfair competitive advantages. Therefore, the documents do qualify for confidential protection under the Kentucky Open Records Act at KRS § 61.878(1)(c)1, which excludes from the open records requirement confidential or proprietary records "generally recognized as confidential or proprietary, which if openly disclosed would permit an unfair commercial advantage to competitors of the entity that disclosed the records." The subject documents are the exact type of information that is confidential and proprietary, and, thus, deserving of continued confidential protection. Southeastern United Medigroup, Inc. v. Hughes, 952 S.W.2d 195, 199 (Ky. 1997) (holding that if disclosure of documents would give competitors an unfair advantage, then confidential protection is warranted).

Additionally, regardless of the confidential nature of the subject documents, Movants' Motion is not appropriate in this case. The Commission has already ruled that this case is *not the correct forum* to raise the issues of cost of labor, "local investment or the Commonwealth's business and employment wellbeing." (March 4, 2005 Order, p. 2). Despite that ruling and the Commission's admonition to Movants to limit the issues they address in this case to issues

properly before the Commission in this case (March 4, 2005 Order, p. 3), Movants assert that the documents should be unsealed because Movants have "a substantial interest in reviewing RFP criteria regarding major construction proposal, to gain an insight into criteria utilized by LG&E with regard to employment of Kentucky workers." (Motion, p. 2). Thus, the clearly stated purpose of the Motion is in direct violation of the Commission's March 4, 2005 Order. Accordingly, for that reason as well, the Motion should be denied.

WHEREFORE, the Companies hereby respectfully request the Commission to deny Movants' March 17, 2005 Motion to Release Documents Under Seal.

Dated: March 28, 2005

Respectfully submitted,

Kendrick R. Riggs
J. Gregory Cornett

Ogden Newell & Welch PLLC

1700 PNC Plaza

500 West Jefferson Street

Louisville, Kentucky 40202

Telephone: (502) 582-1601

Robert M. Watt III Lindsey W. Ingram, III Stoll, Keenon & Park, LLP 300 West Vine Street, Suite 2100 Lexington, Kentucky 40507-1801

Telephone: (859) 231-3000

Elizabeth L. Cocanougher Senior Regulatory Counsel Louisville Gas and Electric Company 220 West Main Street Post Office Box 32010 Louisville, Kentucky 40232 Telephone: (502) 627-4850

Counsel for Louisville Gas and Electric Company and Kentucky Utilities Company

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that a true and correct copy of the foregoing Response was served on the following persons on the 28th day of March, 2005, U.S. mail, postage prepaid:

Elizabeth E. Blackford Assistant Attorney General Office of the Attorney General Office of Rate Intervention 1024 Capital Center Drive, Suite 200 Frankfort, Kentucky 40601 John N. Hughes Attorney at Law 124 West Todd Street Frankfort, Kentucky 40601

Michael L. Kurtz Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry 36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510 Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

Troy A. Fodor, P.C. 913 South Sixth Street

Springfield, Illinois 62703

Don Meade Priddy, Isenberg, Miller & Meade, PLLC 800 Republic Building 429 West Muhammad Ali Boulevard Louisville, Kentucky 40202 Daniel A. Lane Vice President and Managing Counsel Indiana Municipal Power Agency 11610 North College Avenue Carmel, Indiana 46032

Douglas L. Jeavons Managing Director BBC Research & Consulting 3773 Cherry Creek North Drive, Suite 850 Denver, Colorado 80209-0448

Irv Maze
Jefferson County Attorney
N. Scott Lilly
Second Assistant County Attorney
Hall of Justice, 2nd Floor
600 West Jefferson Street
Louisville, Kentucky 40202

Counsel for Louisville Gas and Electric Company and Kentucky Utilities Company